

## Assessment Peer Review: Critical Elements Analysis Chart

---

To comply with Section 1111(e) of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA) as amended by the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), states are required to submit evidence associated with their assessment systems to the United States Department of Education (ED) for peer review.

The peer review process requires cohorts of trained experts to evaluate state-submitted evidence as it relates to a number of established criteria, organized by and divided into [Critical Elements](#) (CEs). Each decision letter issued outlines the CEs for which states must submit additional evidence to meet the statutory and regulatory requirements for standards and assessment based on peer review feedback on state-submitted documentation.

The [CE Analysis chart](#), available as an Excel download, allows users to compare feedback received in assessment peer review decision letters across states and/or CEs for which additional documentation was requested. Users can also filter by assessment administered and whether the assessment has met requirements, substantially or partially met requirements, or, is not directly referenced in the state's decision letter.

The chart was constructed by analyzing the information contained in the [decision letters on each state's final assessment system](#) that have been issued by ED. For each distinct area of a state's assessment system that could have been submitted for peer review, a tab has been created: high school reading/language arts (R/LA) and mathematics (M), grades 3–8 R/LA and M, high school science (S), grades 3–8 S, Alternate Assessments (ALT) for R/LA and M, ALT S, English language proficiency (ELP) for K–12, ALT ELP, and native language assessments. The decision letters issued indicate if an assessment has either substantially or

partially met statutory and regulatory requirements, and this information is reflected in the chart. Not all assessments have received peer review determinations and thus are not referenced in decision letters; a note is included in the chart to identify these assessments.

Each critical element in the spreadsheet indicated as needing additional documentation in order to meet the requirements of ED is identified by a green cell marked with an X. Users should reference each state's decision letter to obtain more specific information surrounding the type(s) of additional evidence requested. In some cases, additional evidence was requested with regard to specific subsections of each assessment; for example, some states were asked only for additional R/LA assessment documentation. These instances have been noted as R/LA only or M only, as the case may be.

Decision letters may also reference a state's entire assessment system with regard to the submission of additional evidence for a particular CE. When this occurs, each assessment in the state's assessment system is indicated as needing to submit additional evidence regardless of whether or not that assessment is referenced in the decision letter for that state.



CSAI Update is produced by The Center on Standards and Assessment Implementation (CSAI). CSAI, a collaboration between WestEd and CRESST, provides state education agencies (SEAs) and Regional Comprehensive Centers (RCCs) with research support, technical assistance, tools, and other resources to help inform decisions about standards, assessment, and accountability. Visit [www.csai-online.org](http://www.csai-online.org) for more information.



WestEd is a nonpartisan, nonprofit research, development, and service agency that partners with education and other communities throughout the United States and abroad to promote excellence, achieve equity, and improve learning for children, youth, and adults. WestEd has more than a dozen offices nationwide, from Massachusetts, Vermont and Georgia, to Illinois, Arizona and California, with headquarters in San Francisco.

For more information, visit [WestEd.org](http://WestEd.org); call 415.565.3000 or toll-free, (877) 4-WestEd; or write: WestEd / 730 Harrison Street / San Francisco, CA 94107-1242.